



MARCH 20, 2023

VIA EMAIL: AAROSS@LIVERMORECA.GOV

Governor's Office of Planning & Research

Andy Ross, Economic Development Manager
City of Livermore

March 20 2023

Innovation and Economic Development Department **STATE CLEARING HOUSE**
1052 South Livermore Avenue
Livermore, CA 94550

Dear Mr. Ross:

NOTICE OF PREPARATION OF A DRAFT ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT REPORT FOR THE
LIVERMORE GENERAL PLAN 2045 PROJECT, SCH# 2023030225

The Department of Conservation's (Department) Division of Land Resource Protection (Division) has reviewed the Notice of Preparation of a Draft Environmental Impact Report for the Livermore General Plan 2045 Project (Project). The Division monitors farmland conversion on a statewide basis, provides technical assistance regarding the Williamson Act, and administers various agricultural land conservation programs. We offer the following comments and recommendations with respect to the project's potential impacts on agricultural land and resources.

Project Description

The City of Livermore is preparing a comprehensive update to its existing General Plan. The update will guide the City's development and conservation through 2045. The overall purpose of the proposed General Plan 2045 is to create a policy framework that articulates a vision for the General Plan planning area in 2045. The key components of the proposed project will include broad community goals for the future of Livermore and specific policies and implementing actions that will help meet the goals. The proposed General Plan 2045 will add new and expanded policy topics to address the current requirements of State law, modernize the City's policy framework, and update the General Plan land use map to plan for future services, jobs, parks, and housing and to address land use mapping issues and inconsistencies. To achieve the proposed General Plan 2045 vision, the City will analyze land use alternatives and will prepare a refined preferred land use scenario that is developed through an extensive public process.

Department Comments

The conversion of agricultural land represents a permanent reduction and significant impact to California's agricultural land resources. CEQA requires that all feasible and reasonable mitigation be reviewed and applied to projects. Under CEQA, a lead agency should not approve a project if there are feasible alternatives or feasible mitigation measures available that would lessen the significant effects of the project.

All mitigation measures that are potentially feasible should be included in the project's environmental review. A measure brought to the attention of the lead agency should not be left out unless it is infeasible based on its elements.

Consistent with CEQA Guidelines, the Department recommends the consideration of agricultural conservation easements, among other measures, as potential mitigation. (See Cal. Code Regs., tit. 14, § 15370 [mitigation includes "compensating for the impact by replacing or providing substitute resources or environments, including through permanent protection of such resources in the form of conservation easements."])

Mitigation through agricultural easements can take at least two forms: the outright purchase of easements or the donation of mitigation fees to a local, regional, or statewide organization or agency whose purpose includes the acquisition and stewardship of agricultural easements. The conversion of agricultural land should be deemed an impact of at least regional significance. Hence, the search for replacement lands should not be limited strictly to lands within the project's surrounding area.

A helpful source for regional and statewide agricultural mitigation banks is the California Council of Land Trusts. They provide helpful insight into farmland mitigation policies and implementation strategies, including a guidebook with model policies and a model local ordinance. The guidebook can be found at:

[California Council of Land Trusts](#)

Of course, the use of conservation easements is only one form of mitigation that should be considered. Any other feasible mitigation measures should also be considered. Indeed, the recent judicial opinion in *King and Gardiner Farms, LLC v. County of Kern* (2020) 45 Cal.App.5th 814 ("KG Farms") holds that agricultural conservation easements on a 1 to 1 ratio are not alone sufficient to adequately mitigate a project's conversion of agricultural land. KG Farms does not stand for the proposition that agricultural conservation easements are irrelevant as mitigation. Rather, the holding suggests that to the extent they are considered, they may need to be applied at a greater than 1 to 1 ratio, or combined with other forms of mitigation (such as restoration of some land not currently used as farmland).

The Department recommends further discussion of the following issues:

- Type, amount, and location of farmland conversion resulting directly and indirectly from implementation of the proposed project.
- Impacts on any current and future agricultural operations in the vicinity; e.g., land-use conflicts, increases in land values and taxes, loss of agricultural support infrastructure such as processing facilities, etc.
- Incremental impacts leading to cumulative impacts on agricultural land. This would include impacts from the proposed project, as well as impacts from past, current, and likely future projects.
- Proposed mitigation measures for all impacted agricultural lands within the proposed project area.
- Projects compatibility with lands within an agricultural preserve and/or enrolled in a Williamson Act contract.
- If applicable, notification of Williamson Act contract non-renewal and/or cancellation.

Conclusion

Thank you for giving us the opportunity to comment on the Notice of Preparation of a Draft Environmental Impact Report for the Livermore General Plan 2045 Project. The Department suggests the lead agency review the proposed projects compatibility with the existing Williamson Act contract. Please provide this Department with notices of any future hearing dates as well as any staff reports pertaining to this project. If you have any questions regarding our comments, please contact Farl Grundy, Associate Environmental Planner via email at Farl.Grundy@conservation.ca.gov.

Sincerely,

Monique Wilber

Monique Wilber
Conservation Program Support Supervisor